

Paper Review

(Joint reviews allowed. All will get same grade. But each should be prepared to answer questions about the paper in a pop-up quiz fashion.)

- Summary: (2 paragraphs about 5 lines each) [30 points]

Summarize the problem that the paper is addressing, the criticism/shortcomings that the paper provides for previous/related work, the approach/solution that the paper provides to overcome the previous shortcomings, and the main conclusions/results of the paper.

[Use your own words to describe the summary (i.e., do *not* copy). You may use ideas from the abstract and conclusion in addition to your own understanding from reading the paper carefully.]

- Strengths and weaknesses of the paper: (at least 2 strengths and 2 weaknesses. Write about 2 lines for each) [30 points: 15+15]

Provide your own view about the paper's approach (was it a good one, in which ways? was it a bad approach, in which ways?).

Is this paper a major or marginal contribution? Why do you think this is a major (or marginal) contribution to the field?

- Points and suggestions of improvement: (suggest 3 ideas at least. Write about 3 lines for each) [30 points]

Provide your own input to address the problems of the paper and suggest ways in which the paper could be improved. If you were to re-do this study yourself, which points would you improve upon and how?

- Exam-like question (not to exceed 4 lines) and its answer (not to exceed 10 lines) [10 points: 5 + 5]

– Assessment of the review:

- Based on originality (your own words and arguments, not copying), strength of argument, accuracy, identifying the major points, clarity.

- Summary 30%, strength and weaknesses 30%, improvement suggestions 30%, exam-like question 10%.

note: to help book-keeping please number the reviews that you submit (from 1 to 10). This will help you/me keep track of your reviews (you should have 10 reviews by the end of semester). There will be available space in the review template to enter your review number.

Submit your reviews as hardcopy during the lecture. Also, please keep an electronic copy for reference. Do *not* email your reviews unless explicitly requested to do so. Thanks.

Please follow the template provided on the web site for your reviews.