

Feedback on Project 3 version 2

Team	Grade	Comments
Team01	3.5	Server recovery sequence not mentioned, polling information missing, extra commands that must be supported missing
Team02	3	Server Discovery is not reliable (acknowledgements would be better), Node discovery uses BFS, but what's the message format? Backup of neighbor list is not mentioned.
Team03	3.5	Too complicated
Team04	4	Server recovery protocol missing
Team05	2	Message format not provided. It is incomplete! Neighbor Discovery: Server choosing another server as its neighbor functionality has not been provided in the message format. FD_heartbeat: Using multicasting to detect failure of neighbor Servers has the following overhead Each server will then belong to so many multicast groups. Also updating the list every time even when all neighbor servers and users are up and running is wastage of resources!
Team07	OUR	
Team08	3.5	I am not sure what the difference between Server Discovery and Neighbor Discovery is. If it is for Name Collision purposes then its fine! Server Failure Detection User Agent: Is the alive message sent by the Server to the Agents? Server -> User Agents?? Search: How does the response when an user agent is found in another Server's list propagate to the user agent of the Server that sent out the query? I couldn't understand the Chatroom Ownership concept of yours
Team09	3.5	Name collision not done. Message format for checking if server/agent is alive not provided
Team10	2.5	Neighbor - I guess the Server sends messages to all Servers in the network and not to specific Servers ? Reconnect is sent by who? The original server or the server that is currently taking care of the orphaned User agents? User Agent to User Agent communication message format not provided
Team11	4.5	Good
Team12	4.0	Known users, Known servers not needed. Not clear how neighbors are chosen. Why do we need the private communication channel b/w servers?
Team14	4.0	No need for neighbors to share their user lists. We dont need to send 'discovered servers' messages to each neighbor.
Team15	3.5	Tree concept has its own pros and cons. We can get disjoint forests if a server dies and never comes back again.
Chaudhuri.pdf	2	Not clear
Reza.pdf	4	No need of explicit dropping connection between servers